MPC MAJOR RESEARCH PAPER

WHOSE LIVES ARE IMPORTANT?: A MEDIA ANALYSIS OF
THE 2010 HAITI AND PAKISTAN DISASTERS

SARAH HUGHES

Professor J. DiNova

The Major Research Paper is submitted
in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of
Master of Professional Communication

Ryerson University
Toronto, Ontario, Canada

August 15, 2011

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this Major Research Paper.

I authorize Ryerson University to lend this MRP to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

Signature _____

I further authorize Ryerson University to reproduce this MRP by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

Signature_____

ABSTRACT

In 2010, Haiti and Pakistan experienced immense suffering, death and destruction as these countries faced two of the world's greatest humanitarian crises. The earthquake in Haiti was very well reported. Celebrities, organizations and individuals recognized the need for help and contributed generously to various relief foundations. Unlike the attention Haiti received, the flood in Pakistan received far less media coverage. The lack of media attention in Pakistan arguably limited the public's awareness of the flood and reduced the perception of urgency and need for humanitarian support (Winthrop, 2010).

This MRP focuses on the news media in the service of reporting on international crises and investigates how the media takes an ideological position when reporting and presenting events to its audience. In this paper, I demonstrate how reporting in a major Canadian newspaper becomes an exercise in ideological power and influences audiences (Fairclough, 2001).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I

Introduction

In January 2010, a devastating earthquake struck Haiti, and later in July Pakistan began to experience some of the worst floods in the country's history. The crisis in Haiti was very well reported. Celebrities, organizations and individuals recognized the need for help and contributed generously to various relief foundations. Unlike the attention Haiti received, the flood in Pakistan received far less media coverage. The lack of media attention in Pakistan arguably limited the public's awareness of the flood and reduced the perception of urgency and need for humanitarian support (Winthrop, 2010).

This MRP focuses on the news media in the service of reporting on international crises and investigates how the media takes an ideological position when reporting and presenting events to its audience. I demonstrate how reporting in a major Canadian newspaper becomes an exercise in ideological power and influences audiences. In addition to identifying the instances of ideological discourse, I also reveal that these instances are part of a larger social structure (Fairclough, 2001).

In my project, I conducted a critical discourse analysis on Canadian newspaper articles and editorials discussing the case of the 2010 Haiti earthquake and Pakistan flood. A linguistic framework known as the syntagmatic model (Hodge & Kress, 1993) assisted in my data analysis. In addition, Maxwell McCombs's and Donald Shaw's agenda-setting theory (1972) and Louis Althusser's concept of ideology (1971) helped frame my analysis and assisted in the interpretation of the data. These particular concepts were selected with the aim of determining how the media convey and reaffirm ideological power and beliefs and demonstrate that this can in turn influence public behaviour and reactions to issues and events such as international crises.

My interest in this topic began during the summer of 2010 when I noticed an apparent

difference in the media coverage between the Haiti and Pakistan disasters. At this time, the damage and severity of the flood was at its peak. Pakistani victims were experiencing malnutrition, disease and a lack of humanitarian aid from the international community while the earthquake and recovery (that took place in January) continued to receive a great deal of media attention. Accordingly, I feel a comparison between the media response to the 2010 Haiti and Pakistan crises deserves consideration, as it is an important human rights issue. Whether a crisis is an earthquake, flood, hurricane or tornado, the international community must provide adequate humanitarian support to assist all those at risk.

In the case of the Haiti and Pakistan disasters, the media presented their judgments and evaluations regarding the various issues surrounding these crises. In other words, the media presented their ideological views about the Haiti and Pakistan disasters to the public. The following media analysis offers an understanding of the underlying ideologies that led to the overwhelming disparity in media coverage, which potentially limited the humanitarian aid collected for the victims in Pakistan in comparison to those in Haiti. Thus, in this major research project, I hope to contribute to agenda-setting research, illuminate issues of media biases and demonstrate how these issues can influence audiences and in turn impact the lives of victims in crisis.

Background

On January 12th, 2010, Haiti experienced a catastrophic earthquake, measuring 7.0 on the Richter scale and causing widespread devastation across the nation. Following the first major earthquake, the country experienced nearly 52 aftershocks throughout the subsequent weeks, measuring 4.5 or greater. According to the Haitian government, there were an estimated 360,000 casualties, 300,000 injured and 1,000,000 made homeless. The Haitian government also estimated that 250,000 residences and 30,000 commercial buildings were destroyed or severely

damaged, including notable landmarks such as the Presidential Palace, Port-au-Prince Cathedral and the main jail (Winthrop, 2010).

Several countries responded to appeals for humanitarian aid by pledging funds and sending multi-facetted rescue teams including medical professionals, engineers, and security and support personnel. However, damage to communication systems, hospitals and air and land transportation facilities made it incredibly difficult to prioritize and execute rescue and aid efforts. Delays in aid distribution led to angry appeals from aid workers and survivors, and as a result, severe looting and intermittent violence occurred (Winthrop, 2010).

Canada played a critical role in the humanitarian efforts throughout the earthquake recovery. The government contributed generously monetarily and provided extensive professional rescue services. Specifically, the Canadian government provided over 2,000 Canadian forces and over $220 million, which was allocated to various relief efforts. These efforts included emergency needs and reconstruction programs to assist with the rescue as well as training programs for Haitian police officers. In addition, Canadians raised approximately $65.15 million in individual donations (Embassy of Canada in Haiti, 2011).

The Canadian government also authorized several foreign relations action plans as part of their participation in the Haiti recovery. For instance, the government launched Operation Stork, allowing Haitian children to be adopted by Canadian families. The program resulted in approximately 203 successful adoptions. The government also launched several additional security and diplomatic programs since the earthquake (Embassy of Canada in Haiti, 2011).

Haiti has had a longstanding relationship with Canada, receiving tremendous monetary and diplomatic support over the years: "In total, between 2006 and 2012, the government of Canada has committed more than $1 billion towards Haiti, which makes this country Canada's largest aid beneficiary in the Americas" (Embassy of Canada in Haiti, 2011, para. 3). Canada has

been heavily invested in Haiti for several years and would presumably aim to sustain their commitment to the country in such horrific circumstances.

Finally, the earthquake in Haiti generated a tremendous amount of media interest. Winthrop (2010) reported that there were approximately 3,000 stories regarding the earthquake in both broadcast and print media by Day 10. This is a notable figure, particularly in comparison to the amount of media attention dedicated to the Pakistan flood victims.

The Pakistan flood began on July 26th, 2010, with severe monsoon rain, which continued for several weeks. Approximately one fifth of the country's land area was submerged and the floods continued to affect parts of the country and plague the nation's health and livelihood for months. According to a communication issued by the Pakistani government, approximately 20 million people were directly affected by the flood, including an estimated 1,600 killed and millions left without access to clean water, food or shelter. The number of people affected by the flood constitutes approximately twelve per cent of Pakistan's total population. In other words, the number of people affected in this disaster is greater than the combined total affected by the 2004 Kasmir earthquake and the 2010 Haiti earthquake.

The Canadian government's participation in the humanitarian recovery in Pakistan was less extensive than that in Haiti. Specifically, the government allocated $79.1 million to various United-Nations agencies to provide humanitarian assistance and early recovery in Pakistan. Some of these agencies include UNICEF, The World Health Organization, The International Federation of the Red Cross, and the Canadian Red Cross, among others (Government of Canada, 2011). Thus, the government's monetary and diplomatic involvement in the Pakistani recovery was minimal in comparison to its involvement in Haiti. Similarly, Canadian's donor behaviour was also minimal in comparison to the Haiti crisis.

There was far less media interest in the Pakistan floods than the earthquake in Haiti.

Winthrop (2010) reported an estimated 320 broadcast and 730 print stories covering the flood by Day 10 and 1,800 print stories by Day 20, a notable difference from the media coverage received by earthquake in Haiti. Thus, in addition to the political relationships between Canada and these respective countries, the noteworthy media interest for Haiti presumably had tremendous agenda-setting effects, making the crisis in Haiti more prominent than the crisis in Pakistan.

CHAPTER II

Literature Review

A combination of critical theories helped frame my analysis and assisted in the interpretation of my data. I incorporated specific media theories, such as agenda-setting and media framing theories. I also included the views of Louis Althusser, Antonio Gramsci and Norman Fairclough on ideology and the views of Frantz Fanon on critical race theory. These concepts, described in the following literature review, were ideal for my analysis as they focus on media, power and ideologies, and facilitated my discussion of the ways in which the media convey and reaffirm ideological power and beliefs.

Theoretical Framework

Agenda-Setting Theory

Prior to the 1972 publication of *The Agenda-Setting Function of the Mass Media* by McCombs and Shaw, agenda-setting was only a conceptual idea. Media scholars typically examined the direct effects of the media in changing the public's attitudes and behaviours; however, very little empirical evience could support the supposed directional effects from the mass media: "A number of early communication scholars [...] believed that the mass media affected the public in important ways, but the empirical research finding of that time only supported minimal affects" (Dearing, 1996, p. 12). The lack of evidence for the directional effect perspective led McCombs and Shaw to develop an alternative model.

McCombs and Shaw's 1972 study, discussed on page eleven, reveal a positive relationship between the salience of the media agenda and the public agenda, which provided evidence that complemented earlier theorists' beliefs about the power of the media. In their

article, McCombs and Shaw determine that "media affects were cognitive rather than persuasive" (Dearing, 1996, p. 12), which transformed the way scholars investigate and theorize media effects.

McCombs and Shaw suggest that the media monitor and report about events but tend to focus on some more than others. Agenda-setting explains the correlation between the rate at which the media cover a story and the extent to which the public think the story is important (McCombs, 2004). One of the main focuses of agenda-setting is salience transfer, which is the ability of the mass media to put forward and advance issues to the public. This theory avoids discussions about persuasion and focuses on understanding how public opinion is shaped not by the media telling people what to think, but by telling people what to think *about* (McCombs, 2004). The concept of agenda-setting may assist in understanding the difference in humanitarian support provided to the victims of the Haiti earthquake in comparison to the Pakistan flood, based on the difference in media attention garnered by each crises.

Critical Cultural Framework

This research project takes a critical theoretical orientation. Critical theory is rooted in Marxist thinking. Marxism is primarily concerned with issues of class struggle, systems of domination or dependence, expanding the scope of autonomy and reducing the extent of domination (Lindlof, 2002). In the context of the media, this perspective argues that the media enables the upper class to influence and control society by the images and messages the media choose to convey, thereby supporting particularly ideologies. In this project, I consider the views of Antonio Gramsci, Louis Althusser, and Norman Fairclough on ideology.

Antonio Gramsci coined the term "cultural hegemony" to explain the notion that the views of the dominant class become the norm of society and are perceived as common ideologies

in a culture (Gramsci). He believed that the media along with other institutional forces play a dominant role in "producing ideological legitimation of the existing institutions and social order" (Gramsci). Gramsci would argue that the choices of what stories and images the elite media professionals relay help produce and sustain the dominant class' ideological views.

Similarly, Louis Althusser, also a Marxist thinker, suggested the state and the media have the ability to exercise control over the public to reproduce its ideological power. In *Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses* (1971), Althusser proposed a relationship between the state and other social structures with the public. In his view, ideology is the most influential means for power. He suggests that the public's values, opinions and preferences are instilled in them by social practices, and these practices are necessary for individuals to conceive society and their place within it. Further to this, when the public perform behaviours that are considered socially acceptable, they become ideological subjects, as beliefs regarding appropriate behaviours are embedded within society (Althusser, 1971).

Norman Fairclough (2001), also considered in this study, focuses on understanding the ways in which communication influences and is influenced by social institutions and structures of power. Fairclough suggests that textual and visual discourse may be used as means for ideological power. For the purposes of this MRP, Fairclough would argue that the messages and images presented by the media are shaped by cultural ideologies embedded in our society and help reaffirm systems of control and ideological power. Overall, this MRP highlights ideology and ideological discourse to reveal underlying views and structures of power in the context of international crises and their representation in the media.

Media Framing

Media framing is a similar concept to agenda-setting but focuses on media content as an

influence on attitudes and behaviours rather than media coverage. The language used in media reports may have a powerful impact on the way the public interprets a news story. The basic principle of framing is that the visual and verbal material of a story can help influence the way an individual interprets the issues and forms their opinions (Nelson, Clawson & Oxley, 1997): "The portrayals, or frames, can exert appreciable influence on citizens' perceptions of the issue and, ultimately, the opinions they express" (Nelson et al., 1997, p. 576). Thus, the way an issue or object is represented in the media will influence the public's perception and opinion towards that issue.

Some theorists also consider the concept of framing as an extension of agenda-setting or priming (Scheufele & Tewkbury, 2007). Priming is the prior context that audiences have with respect to an object or event: "Judgments and attitude formation are directly correlated with the ease in which instances or associations could be brought to mind" (Scheufele & Tewkbury, 2007, p. 11). By making some issues more prevalent than others (agenda-setting), the media can also influence the public's attention, opinions, decisions, reactions, and behaviours. Therefore, priming follows a memory-based model; in other words, issues that receive more attention may resonate longer with an individual than others.

Critical Race Theory

Haiti has a long history of violence, slavery, and oppression tracing back to the sixteen hundreds. The French, who developed large sugar plantations by utilizing slave labour from Africa, colonized the country in 1659. The county experienced several rebellions over the years, many of which arose from social, political, and ethnic hierarchies that remain embedded in Haitian society. A great deal of this tension arose because the majority of Haiti's political power was primarily in the hands of European landowners, although the vast majority of the Haitian's

population is of African descent (Higman, 2011).

In addition to France, many other European and Western countries have been involved in Haiti's political affairs. Since colonization, Britain, Spain, and the United-States have imposed their political and social ideologies on Haiti. Haiti's history of colonialism and oppression has continued to torment the nation and remains an embedded source of tension towards Europe and the Western world (Higman, 2011).

Frantz Fanon, a French philosopher, writes critically about colonialism in his book *The Wretched of the Earth* (1961). Fanon questions the underlying motivations of larger capitalist nations aiding underdeveloped countries. In reference to aiding a poor undeveloped country, Fanon states, "it's just reparation that will be paid to us" (Fanon, 1961, p. 102). In his view, the act of good will from a "superior" nation is essentially a means of reconciling a politically hostile relationship that traces back hundreds of years. Fanon also reflects on the capitalist motivations for assisting a third world country: "At a pinch [capitalist countries] willingly agree to lend money to young states, but only on conditions that this money is used to buy manufactured products and machines: in other words, that it serves to keep the factories in the mother country going" (Fanon, 1961, p.104). Thus, capitalist countries that have investments in an underdeveloped country such as manufacturing facilities (i.e. sweatshops) may be inclined to aid nations in crisis to support their own businesses who are employing third world labour, thereby supporting their own financial agendas.

Relevant Research

McCombs and Shaw's study, *The Agenda-Setting Function of the Mass Media* (1972), revealed a positive relationship between the salience of the media agenda and public agenda. This study provided evidence that complemented earlier theorists' beliefs about the power of the

media. McCombs and Shaw determined that "media affects were cognitive rather than persuasive" (Dearing, 1996, p. 12). Specifically, McCombs and Shaw examined the role of the media in the 1968 presidential campaign in Chapel Hill, North Carolina. The authors compared what the Chapel Hill voters thought were important issues of the campaign with the issues that were covered in the media. Voters were asked to name some of the major issues of the day (foreign policy and law and order). Their findings demonstrated a strong correlation between the importance placed on the various campaign topics by the media and voter perceptions, confirming the power of the media and its ability to influence public opinion and behaviour (McCombs & Shaw, 1972).

International news coverage also tends to influence the way audiences perceive particular countries. Besova & Cooley studied this phenomenon in *Foreign News and Public Opinion: Attribute Agenda-Setting Theory Revisited* (2009). Their results revealed a positive correlation between media coverage and the audience's perception about foreign nations. Negative media exposure tends to have more agenda-setting effects than positive or neutral media exposure. Researchers found "coverage of the African continent constituted only 5.6 percent of international news produced by US news media. This 5.6 percent offers for its intended audience little depth in the portrayed of an entire continent" (Besova & Cooley, 2009, p. 219). Thus, research demonstrates that media portrayals of foreign nations tend to be stereotypical and focus on a limited number of stories that support the audience's perceptions of certain countries.

James Elliot and Jeremy Pais examined how social identity and larger social ideological structures shaped the response to Hurricane Katrina in 2005 in their article *Race, Class, and Hurricane Katrina: Social Difference in Human Responses to Disaster* (2006). Elliot and Pais revealed that racism remains embedded in North American culture. From issues of communication, planning, response, evacuation, and short-term and long-term support, there

11

appeared to be strong differences regarding the experience of distinct racial and class groups. Specifically, the authors reported a clear disregard for the wellbeing of lower income African Americans during this crisis (Elliot & Pais, 2006). Elliot & Pais' study demonstrates how larger social structures influenced the communications response to victims of crisis, which corresponds with the findings between the Haiti and Pakistan crises.

Finally, William Adams (1986) analyzed how U.S. television media prioritize its coverage of natural disasters. He compared the severity of various natural disasters around the world by considering the loss of life with the events covered on U.S. nightly newscasts. His findings demonstrate that there is no correlation between the number of casualties of natural disasters and their media attention. He did, however, determine that there were other contributing factors shaping how the media prioritizes its coverage. Adams claimed that there are three such factors determining media attention to one disaster over another. These factors include the following: (1) Attitudes and ideologies that may appeal to the audience, the media's own personal views, or those that resemble society's overall views; (2) whether the disaster occurred in a location that is popular with the audience (i.e. a common tourist destination); (3) proximity of the U.S. and the country in crisis (Adam, 1986).

Adams determined that the severity of natural disasters does not determine the amount of media attention these types of events receive. For instance, Adams found that the "media is prioritized so that the death of one Western European equaled 3 Eastern Europeans equaled 9 Latin Americans equaled 11 Middle Eastern equaled 12 Asians" (Adams, 1986, p.122). There is little to no correlation between media coverage and the tragedies involved in various international disasters. This finding has important sociopolitical meaning as it may indicate that there are larger ideological factors at work. Also, the lack of media attention has significant

implications for audience consciousness. The lack of coverage limits audience awareness and public discourse, both of which could limit altruism and public support for victims.

Research Questions

The Haiti earthquake directly affected an estimated 3 million people. This figure reflects the number of people killed, left homeless, and without access to food or clean water (Ferris 2010). In terms of the Pakistan flood, approximately 20 million people were directly affected: 1,600 people were killed and others left without access to clean water, food, or shelter for several weeks (Ferris, 2010).

According to an online poll involving 1,000 randomly selected adults (Mukerji, 2010), Canadians were not rushing to help those affected by the Pakistan floods like they were for the victims of the Haiti earthquake. This poll revealed that approximately 38% of Canadians helped Haiti, while only 4% helped those in Pakistan. Consequently, the victims in Haiti received far more humanitarian support than the victims in Pakistan. Haiti earned almost twice as much humanitarian funding compared to Pakistan; in fact $3.3 billion was raised in comparison to $1.6 billion (Ferris, 2010). Thus, there is a significant discrepancy in the public response to the Haiti and Pakistan disasters of 2010. As such, this MRP attempts to answer the following five questions:

1. How did the media portray the Haiti and Pakistan crises?
2. What judgments did the media make about the crises?
3. Was agenda-setting a factor in the case of the Haiti and Pakistan disasters?
4. What underlying ideologies does the media reveal about our larger social structures?
5. How did these ideologies impact the public's response to the 2010 Haiti and Pakistan disasters?

CHAPTER III

Methodology

Data Collection:

The Globe and Mail was selected as the primary source of data for my study, as this publication has a large national audience and complements the Canadian focus of this project. Twenty newspaper articles and editorials (10 Haiti documents and 10 Pakistan documents) were selected for analysis on the basis that they focus on either the 2010 Haiti earthquake or Pakistan flood. A sample of twenty documents allowed for a manageable number of articles to be collected and analyzed during the MRP time frame. This sample also provided adequate credibility for this analysis. The documents were retrieved from *The Globe and Mail* archive, which was available through the Ryerson University Library.

Additional selection criterion required that the articles and editorials be published during a particular time period. Specifically, the documents must have been published within the first eight weeks following the earthquake or flood. Thus, ten articles and editorials regarding the Haiti crises were selected between the date of January 12th, 2010, and March 12th, 2010, and ten articles or editorials were selected for the Pakistan floods between July 26th, 2010, and September 26th, 2010. The two-month time-period was selected with the assumption that the media was focusing most time and attention on each of the crises following the date of the actual event. Therefore, the twenty documents and twelve-week time period allowed for a manageable number of documents to be collected and interpreted during the MRP time frame.

Method of Analysis:

To perform this analysis, I applied Norman Fairclough's principles for critical discourse analysis to uncover the larger sociopolitical structures that contributed to the production and

interpretation of the news, relating to the Haiti and Pakistan crises. According to Fairclough (2001), communication influences and is influenced by social institutions and structures of power. The media can be used as a channel to communicate visual and textual discourse as a means for ideological power. Fairclough describes critical discourse analysis as:

"The study of the often opaque relationship of causality and determination between (a) discursive practices, events and texts, and (b) wider social and cultural structures, relations and processes; to investigate how such practices, events and texts arise out of and are ideologically shaped by relations of power and struggle over power; and to explore how the opacity of these relations between discourse and society is itself a factor securing power and hegemony" (Fairclough, 1995, p 132).

This method aims to produce insight into the way in which discourse reproduces social or political inequality. Fairclough's critical discourse analysis addresses not only the specific structures of text and dialogue, but relates these to structures of the larger sociocultural context (Fairclough, 1995).

In *Language and Power (2nd Ed.)* (2001), Fairclough describes how communication is constrained by larger social and political structures. He identifies three levels of discourse: First, the social condition of production and interpretation (the factors in society that have contributed to the production and how they might affect its interpretation); second, the process of production and interpretation (how the text has been produced and how this may affect interpretation); third, the product of the first and second level, the text (Fairclough, 2001, p. 93).

Fairclough also suggests three different features to consider when performing a critical analysis; *experiential, relational* and *expressive* values. First, the analysis of *experiential* values aims to demonstrate how the text producer's experience of the social world may be revealed

through text. Second, *relational* values may identify a possible relationship between the producer of the text and the receiver. The third feature is the *expressive* value, which is defined as "a trace of a cue to the producer's evaluations (in the widest sense) of the bit of the reality it relates to. Expressive value is to do with subjects and social identities" (Fairclough, 2001, p. 93). For the purpose of my analysis, I focused on Fairclough's third feature, the *expressive* value. This feature helped identify the relevant parties to the text's social identities (Fairclough, 2001). Thus, I analyzed the evaluations and judgments made by the media about the 2010 Haiti earthquake and Pakistan flood to gain an understanding for their ideological views towards both crises.

In order to consider Fairclough's third dimension (the expressive value), I applied Hodge & Kress' syntagmatic model. This model was an ideal tool to conduct my analysis as it focuses on determining how language may be used to articulate ideology and to legitimatize institutions of power. This model also focuses on how a society's fundamental ideologies are reflected in discursive practices (Hodge & Kress, 1993).

The syntagmatic model includes several basic models of the English language including actionals or actional models, and relationals or relational models. As the name suggests, actional models are about action. The relational models do not involve relations of any type of actions or processes (Hodge & Kress, 1993). For the purpose of my study, I focused on the relational model. The relationals include two subtypes: the equative and attributive. The equative model involves a relationship between two nouns, such as the sentence, 'Mary is an instructor.' The attributive model involves a relationship between nouns and qualities, normally adjectives, such as the sentence "the instructor is intelligent." The basis of the relational is essentially the demonstration of an evaluation, judgment or remark regarding a subject (Schryer, 2000).

In this project I analyzed the attributive constructions used by the media in the documents discussing the Haiti and Pakistan disasters. For example, the media used the following attributive

16

constructions to describe the crises: The "situation remains fragile" and "the earthquake is enormous and presents a substantial challenge to Canada and our International Partners." I collected and categorized the adjectives and adverbs described in the documents to determine what kinds of evaluations and judgments the media made about the crises.

In a preliminary analysis, I uncovered seven predominant themes discussed in the documents. These themes included destruction, victims, relief/ aid, the overall crisis, security, Canada, and Haiti or Pakistan (depending on the article's subject). These themes provided a system for organizing the adverbs and adjectives. For the purpose of this study, the themes described above were defined as follows:

- *Destruction* is considered the physical devastation and harm caused by the earthquake in Haiti or flood in Pakistan. For example, an article regarding the Haiti earthquake referred to the damage in Port au Prince as a "large scale disaster."

- *Victims* involved any reference and judgments made regarding the casualties and those injured in the disasters. For example, the victims of the Pakistan floods were described as "truly in need."

- *Relief* or *aid* was defined as the assistance provided or proposed for the victims' of the respective countries. For instance, one document described Haiti as "deserving a genuine rebuilding program."

- Judgments regarding the *crisis* are considered references to chaos or concerns that have transpired or intensified as a result of the earthquake or flood. For example, a document discussing the Haiti earthquake described the state as being a "humanitarian crisis."

- *Security* involved any reference to the safety and danger such as the public's vulnerability or the violence taking place in Haiti and Pakistan. One article described the security in Haiti as a "key concern."

- Judgments that referred to *Canada* included all references to Canada's involvement in the relief effort. For instance, a document stated, "Canada should be commended for its legendary generosity", in reference to its previous charitable giving and altruistic behaviour.

- Finally, judgments regarding *Haiti* or *Pakistan* included the overall state of these countries and the affect the earthquake or flood has had on the social and economic structures of the respective country. For example, an article discussing the devastation in Haiti also focused on highlighting the severe social and economic problems and claimed, "the earthquake merely exacerbated these horrors." The findings, analysis, and interpretations that follow are mapped against the themes outlines above.

CHAPTER IV

Findings

Here I offer various examples of the judgments and evaluations the media presented about the issues surrounding the crises in Haiti and Pakistan. These findings provide an understanding for the underlying ideologies that potentially influenced the public's response to the disasters and limited the humanitarian aid collected for the victims in Pakistan in comparison to those in Haiti.

Destruction

The theme of destruction was emphasized relatively equally in the documents regarding the Haiti earthquake and Pakistan floods. The adjectives and adverbs that appeared in the documents about both disasters helped describe the immense devastation in the regions. Some common judgments included "the worst disaster," "severe damage," "colossal," "massive destruction," and "major catastrophe," among others. One important observation regarding the theme of destruction was the importance placed on the devastation in Haiti and Pakistan. The media incorporated multiple adverbs and adjectives to illustrate the devastation in Haiti, including "horrifying destruction," "scene of destruction," "twisted wreckage," and "dramatic." These expressions, among others appeared in the majority of the documents considered in this analysis. The documents about the Pakistan flood tended to communicate the destruction of the flood as "massive flooding," "worst disaster," "colossal," and a "major catastrophe," similar expressions as those made in reference to Haiti. However, my analysis demonstrated that the media placed less attention on the destruction in Pakistan by expressing fewer judgments regarding the devastation. The media also suggested that the destruction of the Pakistan floods was primarily affecting the country's economy, political structure, and security. In contrast, the

earthquake in Haiti was portrayed as causing loss of life and devastating the country's infrastructure, which have been perceived as deserving greater humanitarian attention.

Victims

My findings reveal that the Haitian and Pakistani victims were focused on differently in the media. There were very few judgments made with respect to the victims in Haiti in comparison to the victims in Pakistan. The Haitian victims were primarily described as being "homeless," in "unfortunate" circumstances, and "impoverished." There was very little attention placed on the effect that the disaster had on the victims; rather the media focused on the widespread poverty experienced by Haitians prior to the earthquake. Overall, Haitians were represented (by the media) as having little agency. As such, their fate must be determined by the international community in order to lift them out of poverty. The media also focused on the effects that the earthquake had on Canadian victims. For example, the media concentrated on the affects that the disaster had on Canadian government officials working in Haiti as well as Canadians who have Haitian relatives who were affected by the disaster.

There was a greater emphasis placed on the suffering caused by and overall impact of the flood in Pakistan. The Pakistani victims were described as "in dire need," "in misery," "hungry" and "suffering." The media also focused on the effect that the flood had on victims' livelihoods and families. There was a greater emphasis on the personal impact of the flood on the Pakistani victims compared to the effect of the earthquake on the Haitian community. Thus, although the media focused on the personal tragedies in Pakistan, there was nevertheless a greater government and public response in Canada to the crises in Haiti, which will be addressed in Chapter V.

Relief/ Aid

My research reveals that the humanitarian aid for Haiti and Pakistan was discussed differently in the media. The greatest emphasis in the articles regarding the flood was the urgency and continuing need for humanitarian aid in Pakistan. The articles regarding the earthquake emphasized Canada's responsibility to provide support and Canada's reputation for altruism. Further to this, there was an emphasis on the supportive and paternalistic relationship between Canada and Haiti. The newspaper documents regarding the earthquake in Haiti also emphasized the need for humanitarian aid. There was even greater attention made to the responsibility of the Canadian government and public to play an active role in the relief effort, such as donating to non-government organizations (The Canadian Red Cross). The media described the humanitarian aid and relief in Haiti as follows: "an immediate need," "considerable support," "requiring a long-term commitment," and in need of a "genuine recovery."

The majority of the newspaper articles and editorials regarding the Pakistan flood focused on the need for humanitarian aid. The relief and aid in Pakistan was described as an "immediate priority," "crucial," the "largest rescue effort," and "slow to come." The media also made reference to the need for adequate leadership in order to execute a successful relief plan. As with Pakistan, the media made reference to the need for effective guidance that Haiti would require in order to execute a successful recovery plan. However, unlike Pakistan, the media strongly implied that this was the responsibility of the Canadian government: "Haiti's crisis is Canada's crisis as well."

Crisis

The crises in Haiti and Pakistan were described comparatively similarly in the media. The focus was placed primarily on the desperation that resulted from disasters, such as hunger,

disease and the attempt to co-ordinate an effective emergency response. The crises in Haiti and Pakistan were commonly described as "unstable," "growing," "chaotic," and "dire." In addition to the attention placed on the demand to provide victims with their basic human needs, such as food, clean water and shelter, the media also emphasized the political crises taking place in both Haiti and Pakistan. This finding was particularly apparent in the documents regarding the Pakistan flood. The media described the political crisis in Pakistan as "gloomy," "fragile," and "insecure." The media did not focus on the political instability in Haiti as much as in Pakistan; rather the media emphasized the lack of government structure available in Haiti to support the relief efforts and uphold order. Further to this, the media appeared to imply a responsibility on Canada to assist in the crisis and humanitarian efforts in Haiti.

Security

In spite of my initial predictions, there were very few comments made by the media regarding security. There were similar concerns and judgments raised in the documents regarding the security in Haiti and Pakistan. The media described the security in Haiti and Pakistan as being both "key concerns." However, the concerns raised in the media were specific to the regions, such as the Taliban and Al-Qaeda in Pakistan and its surrounding regions, and violence and looting in Haiti. The need for Canadian intervention in these regions was, however, conveyed differently in the media. For instance, the media supported the need for Canadian intervention in Haiti, representing Canada's participation in the rescue mission as imperative and a civic responsibility. On the other hand, although the media focused on the security and political instability in Pakistan, the media did not portray security as a Canadian priority in relation to the flood. Rather, the media focused their discussion and judgments towards critical discussions regarding terrorism and civilian militant groups.

Haiti

My findings demonstrate that the media portrayed Haiti as a country that was hopeless even prior to the earthquake. Haiti was described as a country suffering from "abysmal poverty" and "gross inequalities." The media described some of the crises that Haitians experience everyday, such as malnutrition, child mortality, government corruption, and severe crime and violence to name a few. There were a few notable instances in which the media described some positive attributes of Haiti. For example, one article discussed the positive tourism potential in Haiti. A Canadian with business ties in Haiti was quoted in an article as referring to Haiti as a "hidden pearl with tremendous potential." However, this judgment may be considered an exploitive statement framed as a compliment, referring to the country's cheap labour and abysmal labour conditions. Thus, Haiti was generally conveyed as a helpless nation with atrocious living conditions. There was also a particular emphasis on the country's dishonest government, which was portrayed as unwilling to co-operate and forge a place that would improve the lives of its citizens, and without the ability to rebuild the country on its own.

Pakistan

The media often portrayed Pakistan as a self-sustaining country. There was a particular emphasis placed on the fact that people in many of the nation's regions relied on farming to feed themselves and earn a living. This was a primary concern due to the fact that the floods had completely destroyed the nation's croplands and the possibility of any long-term stability for the nation's agricultural industry in the future. There was also a particular focus on Pakistan's political circumstances. As with Haiti, the media discussed on Pakistan's venal society, referring to the Pakistani government as "notoriously corrupt." The media referred to Pakistan as having an "uncertain political future" due to the constant battle between civilian and military leadership.

The media also emphasized the political instability caused by the Taliban, referring to the state as "politically unstable" and "vulnerable" due to the militant group. Thus, in my findings, the Taliban and government instability in Pakistan was by and large the primary focus when discussing the country's overall struggle with managing the monsoon rain and devastating floods.

Canada

Finally, Canada was a predominant theme in my research, revealing noticeable differences in judgments regarding Canada and the crises in Haiti and Pakistan. Specifically, my analysis revealed that the media placed greater attention on Canada in the documents regarding the earthquake compared to the floods. For example, there was a particular focus on Canada and its involvement in the earthquake relief efforts in Haiti but very little interest in Canada's participation in Pakistan. For example, the media often spoke highly of Canadians and their government's involvement in helping Haiti recover from the devastating earthquake. Canada was described as being "committed" to the relief efforts, "well-meaning," "exceptionally generous," "should be proud," and delivering "heartfelt expressions of solidarity" to Haiti. The media also appeared to imply that Canadians and the Canadian government had a responsibility to help Haiti recover from the earthquake. Canada was described as a "rich nation" and as having a "social responsibility" to help Haiti. The media also referred to the "tragedy being Canada's tragedy as well."

In addition, several documents emphasized the importance of Canada's role in the humanitarian relief, mainly in Haiti, due to its global influence as a wealthy and democratic nation. The media appeared to imply a paternalistic relationship vis-à-vis Haiti to help Haiti recover from the earthquake and from the country's other social and economic woes. For

instance, the media described Canada as being in a "favorable pre-disposition" to help Haiti recover, such as having the ability to offer monetary funding, democratic guidance, security, and foreign policies that would enable an effective overall recovery for Haiti. In comparison, there was little to no discussion of Canada providing similar resources or a comparable commitment to the Pakistan recovery. Rather, the media focused primarily on Canada's political and military involvement in the Middle East in light of the region's social and political unrest.

Summary of Findings

In sum, my findings demonstrate that the adjectives and adverbs found in the articles and editorials regarding the earthquake described the majority of the categories that helped shape this project (destruction, aid/ relief, crisis, security, Haiti or Pakistan and Canada). I also found several more illustrative adjectives and judgments made regarding the scope of the destruction and severity of the Haitian crisis. Some examples include, "the situation remains fragile," "massive relief efforts" and "the devastation is horrendous." In comparison, the adjectives and judgments used to describe the flood occurred less frequently in the Pakistan documents. The majority of the attributive constructions referred to the relief efforts and need for aid. Some examples include, "slow start to donations" and "frantically raising funds."

Based on the judgments made by the media, I discovered two predominant themes. First, there was a paternalistic rationale portrayed when describing the proposed strategies for assisting Haiti. For instance, the media suggested that it was up to the international community to determine Haiti's future. In particular, there was an emphasis placed on the responsibility for Canada to intervene and determine Haiti's political, economical and social future. Second, there was a lack of agency attributed to the Haitian victims. The media described the crisis in Haiti, but rarely referred to the Haitian victims. The victims were portrayed as merely subjects of

25

debate regarding the fate of the nation rather than vulnerable members of society with rights and responsibilities in Haiti.

In regards to Pakistan, the majority of the judgments made by the media were in relation to the victims, the urgency for aid and the political instability in the region. I discovered two predominant themes while analyzing these judgments. The first theme relates to the suffering of the Pakistani victims. Flood victims were portrayed by the media as experiencing severe injustice by the lack of humanitarian aid and donor contributions. The second theme relates to the violence and political turmoil in Pakistan and its neighboring countries (Afghanistan, Iraq, etc). The media highlighted issues relating to the political instability as a result of violent militant groups and corrupt leadership, regardless of whether these issues related to the flood or not.

Finally, I made an important observation during the data collection and analysis process in this study, which was the apparent difference in the number of articles and editorials regarding the Haiti and Pakistan disasters. When retrieving the documents from *The Globe and Mail* archive, it was clear that the media focused significantly more attention on the earthquake than the flood. It was more challenging to collect documents about the Pakistan flood due to the limited number of stories discussing the specific subject in comparison to the Haiti earthquake, which I was able to retrieve effortlessly.

CHAPTER V

Analysis & Interpretations

The findings discussed in Chapter IV raise several questions: Why were Haitians' agency undermined in the media? Why did the media emphasize more government intervention in Haiti compared to Pakistan? Why was colonization portrayed as an acceptable means for intervention in Haiti? Why was there such a focus on destruction but little public response in the case of Pakistan? In response to these questions, I have made several interpretations as I examined how the media was used as a channel to convey and reaffirm ideology through discourse. I have also included some additional observations regarding factors that may have influenced the differences in media attention and public response to the Haitian and Pakistani disasters.

Colonization as an Acceptable Means for Recovery in Haiti

The media conveyed strong paternalistic messages in response to the Haiti earthquake and overall recovery mission. There were compelling judgments that supported the policies and practices of government intervention in Haiti. These paternalistic messages supported the Canadian government's intervention in Haiti, suggesting the government would control Haiti by providing for Haitians' needs, potentially without giving them any rights or responsibilities at the hands of the Canadian government, as "Haiti's tragedy [was described as being] Canada's tragedy as well." There was also an emphasis on Canada's "democratic" structure. The media described Canada as being in a "favorable pre-disposition" to help Haiti in their social and economic struggles. Thus, there were strong judgments supporting the idea that colonization was an acceptable means for intervention to assist in the Haiti recovery.

As discussed in Chapter II, Frantz Fanon writes critically about colonization. He questions the underlying motivations of European nations aiding underdeveloped countries. In

reference to aiding a poor undeveloped country, he states: "It's just reparation that will be paid to us" (Fanon, 1961, p. 102). The act of good will from the "superior" nations, such as Canada may be considered a means of reconciling a politically hostile relationship that dates back to slavery. The media is conscious of this public sentiment and, as a result, may have dedicated a great deal of attention to the Haiti crisis.

Fanon also reflects on the "capitalist" motivation for assisting a poor third world country: "At a pinch [capitalist countries] willingly agree to lend money to young states, but only on conditions that this money is used to buy manufactured products and machines; in other words, that it serves to keep the factories in the mother country going" (Fanon, 1961, p.104). Capitalist countries that have investments in an underdeveloped country such as its manufacturing facilities (i.e. sweatshops) may be more inclined to aid nations in crisis to support their own businesses that are employing third world labour. Haiti is home to several textile-manufacturing plants that have ties to large North American clothing companies (GAP clothing company). Thus, Canada may have offered substantial resources and media attention following the crisis for its own economic agenda. Thus, the government and subsequent media interest in the earthquake may not necessarily have been entirely philanthropic.

Colonial struggle and oppression has plagued Haiti for hundreds of years. Since Haiti's independence in 1804, colonial powers have never fully allowed Haiti to develop as a society. Haitians continue to be exploited and, to most, the country represents a place of violence, cheap labour, and immense poverty (Highman, 2011). Even with the vast and apparent international support for and protection of colonialism, imperialism and exploitation, these ideologies continue today, as demonstrated in by my findings.

West-Knows-Best

The media described Canadians as a nation that view itself as having ideal social and political views and practices that should be admired and adopted by other countries (Haiti). For instance, the media described Canada as being in a "favorable pre-disposition" to help Haiti recover, and having the ability to offer monetary funding, democratic guidance, security, and foreign policies that would enable an effective overall recovery for the devastated nation. By portraying Canada in such a glamorized fashion, the public may have felt confident in Canada's proposed mission and encouraged the subtle colonial practice of Canada's political and social intervention in Haiti.

Canada's temporary foreign relations program, Operation Stork, demonstrates Canada's "west-knows-best" ideology. As discussed earlier, Operation Stork is a government program that allowed two hundred Haitian children to travel to Canada for adoption. The Canadian government has enacted special immigration measures in order for these children to migrate to Canada (Embassy of Canada in Haiti, 2011). Operation Stork demonstrates Canada's commitment to the earthquake recovery and Haitian public; however, it also indicates that Canadians assume they are providing a "better" life. Thus, despite the positive outcomes that may result from Operation Stork, this immigration program may be considered a means of control and post-colonial oppression by enforcing political, social, and religious ideologies on vulnerable and powerless children.

Media Framing & the Public's Perception of the Crises

The media focused and framed the crisis in Haiti and Pakistan differently, which may have in turn affected the public's response to these events. My findings demonstrate that the media focused primarily on the severe destruction and abysmal existence that Haitians

29

experience on a daily basis. In the case of Pakistan, however, the media focused on the nation's political insecurity and the importance of the country's agricultural industry. The media focused on the economic threat from the flood and less on the death and misery suffered by Pakistani victims as a result of the disaster. The earthquake was framed in a much more devastating way, in comparison to the flood. The media focused on various aspects of the crisis by describing the massive destruction, fatalities, and suffering that took place in Haiti. My analysis revealed an apparent difference in the way the crises were framed in terms of the importance placed on describing the scale of both disasters. Due to the fact that the media portrayed the earthquake in Haiti as far more severe, Canadians presumably felt a greater need to contribute to the humanitarian efforts, as they had a better understanding for the critical state in Haiti compared to that in Pakistan.

Media Framing & the Public's Perception of Haiti

Although there was a significant focus on the destruction in Haiti and need for public and international aid, the media also focused on the country's troublesome past. For instance, Haiti was often characterized as a state afflicted by inequality, abysmal poverty, disease, violence, and corrupt government. Thus, the media emphasized both the severe political and social challenges the country faced prior to the earthquake as well as paying even greater attention to the disaster. This presumably augmented the public's concern for the country and motivated Canadians to contribute more generously to foundations set up for the Haiti recovery. The attention given to both Haiti's historical and present crises may have also encouraged the public to support the Canadian government's foreign intervention missions, such as Operation Stork. This may have in turn led to the public's support of paternalistic and "west-knows-best" ideologies.

Media Framing & the Public's Perception of Pakistan

Besova & Colley (2009) report that international news coverage tends to impact the way audiences perceive particular countries. In the case of the Haiti and Pakistan disasters, news coverage may have played an important role in affecting the public's perception and decisions to donate to these crises. According to Lydia Saad (2008), American's level of acceptance and positive perceptions for Pakistan fell from 28% in 2007 to 22% in 2008. Consider for example the increase in negative media portrayals of Middle Eastern countries. Since 9/ 11 North American audiences have been flooded with negative images of Middle Eastern countries such as Afghanistan, Iran and Iraq. These Middle Eastern countries, among others tend to be portrayed as corrupt, war-torn and impoverished (Hirchi, 2007). These frames may have led the public to associate Pakistan with the current war taking place in its neighboring country (Afghanistan), causing audiences to be more critical towards the foundations set up to help the victims of the flood, fearing that their donations would not go directly to the people affected by the disaster due to the perception and concern for potential interference by corrupt governments (Winthrop, 2010).

In addition to discrepancies in media coverage, the general framing of these nations may have also contributed to the disparity in public support and donations raised for their relief efforts. Thus, the media helped reaffirm and potentially enhance the public's concern and criticism for the corruption and conflict in the Middle East and possibly reaffirm any racist views the public may have had towards the region. Furthermore, the proximity of Pakistan to Afghanistan may have also affected the decisions of media professionals to cover the flood less extensively than the Haiti earthquake. Since 9/11 and as the war on terrorism continues, the public, particularly Americans, remain apprehensive towards countries such as Afghanistan (Hirchi, 2007). As a result, media professionals may have considered the public's unsettled

views toward the Middle East and decided to pay little attention to this issue in order to avoid any potential controversy that could have risen from a story originating in the region.

Media Framing and the Public's Perception of Canada

The media portrayed Canada as a heroic nation during the Haiti recovery mission, describing Canada as "committed", "well-meaning" and "exceptionally generous." In addition, the media stated that the Canadian public "should be proud" of their support and generosity for the Haitian victims in need. The glamorization and idealization of Canada may have motivated Canadians to participate in the altruistic behaviour that the media described as taking place around the country. In other words, the media appeared to portray helping Haiti in its humanitarian recovery as Canada's patriotic responsibility. The media also portrayed and emphasized Canada's influential role around the world. For example, the media described Canada as a "rich nation" and as having a "social responsibility" to help Haiti. The media also referred to the earthquake as the "tragedy being Canada's tragedy as well," implying that Canadians and the government had a responsibility to help Haiti recover from the earthquake. This representation of Canada and the Canadian public may have led Canadians to believe they had a civic responsibility to help the victims in Haiti.

Canada was not framed in the same manner with respect to the Pakistan flood. In fact, there was very little discussion of Canada in the articles and editorials regarding the flood, particularly in comparison to the amount of Canadian judgments and adjectives made in the documents regarding the earthquake. This finding may reveal that Canadians had little interest in participating in the humanitarian efforts to help the Pakistani victims due to the lack of emphasis placed on Canadians and Canada's global pre-disposition and ability to help countries in crisis.

Agenda-Setting

Possibly the most influential finding in my research took place during the data gathering process. While collecting the articles and editorials from T*he Globe and Mail* archive, I discovered that it was even more challenging than I initially predicted to retrieve documents regarding the Pakistan flood. I spent significantly more time searching the database for articles and editorials about the flood, while effortlessly collecting documents regarding the earthquake. Specifically, in my search I came across approximately one flood story for every four earthquake stories, supporting the belief that the media focused more attention on the earthquake than the flood.

This finding correlates with McCombs's and Shaw's agenda-setting theory, in which they suggest that the media monitor and report about events, but tend to focus on some more than others (McCombs, 2004). This theory explains the correlation between the rate at which the media cover a story and the extent to which the public think the story is important. The difference in media attention garnered by the two crises indicates that the media did in fact focus more intensely on the story in Haiti compared to Pakistan. McCombs and Shaw would argue that this led the public to think that the earthquake in Haiti was more important than the flood in Pakistan, thereby prompting greater donor behaviour for Haiti.

The difference in media attention received by the two crises may have also limited government officials' participation in the Pakistan recovery. The flood would have been neither as well known to them nor a public concern compared to Haiti. Thus, the difference in media coverage may have minimized the government's sense of responsibility to assist in Pakistan in comparison to Haiti.

The media's disregard for the Pakistan flood suggests that Canada holds narrow-minded views towards Pakistan and the Middle East. This finding relates to my earlier discussion

regarding media framing and the Middle East. My findings reveal that the media tended to focus on attributives and judgments regarding the country's political instability and struggle with the Taliban while also making reference to the impact of the crisis. However, the apparent lack in media attention and public response suggests that Canada may hold discriminatory views towards Pakistanis. Unfortunately, the negative media attention regarding the unrest in the Middle East may be the cause of such critical views towards the Pakistani victims. Nevertheless, agenda-setting is a complex concept with several contributing factors. There is presumably a range of motivating factors that contributed to the media focusing on the Haiti earthquake more than the Pakistan flood and these factors should not be ignored. Many of the subcategories discussed in Chapter V, such as those listed below, may also have played a critical role in causing the media to focus on one disaster more than the other, leading to greater public awareness and potentially motivating greater humanitarian funding for Haiti.

The Celebrity Phenomenon

Celebrity endorsements may have played an important role in how much media attention and funds were raised for Haiti in comparison to Pakistan. Research has shown that celebrity endorsements can attract public attention, heighten a message's significance and build a positive view towards the endorsed product or service to in turn generate more money (Thwaites, 1995; Agrawal & Kamakura, 1995; Solomon, Ashmore & Longo, 1992). This marketing approach tends to be particularly successful in North America, as Hollywood stars and other public figures tend to receive extensive media attention. Thus, as Western media is based profoundly on celebrity, the public tends to become more familiar with issues that celebrities frequently associate themselves with.

Following the Haiti earthquake, Brad Pitt and Angelina Jolie pledged $1 million to help

the victims of the disaster. Madonna was reported to have donated $250 thousand and to have encouraged her fans to also help (Bull, 2010). Wyclef Jean, a Haitian born signer, also developed his own charity website where people could make their donations to help the victims of the earthquake. Other well-known celebrities, such as Oprah Winfrey, Conan O'Brien, Ben Stiller, Michelle Obama, George Clooney, Meryl Streep, Lindsay Lohan, and Paris Hilton also contributed to the Haiti relief efforts. They also urged the public to donate by promoting various charitable organizations involved in the Haiti recovery during various interviews, award shows and through social media outlets such as Twitter, generating significant media attention and public awareness. The interest from these well-known celebrities, in turn garnered extensive media attention and public interest in the crisis.

The number of celebrity endorsers for the Pakistan flood was minimal in comparison to the celebrity support demonstrated for the Haiti earthquake. Angelina Jolie was the most recognized celebrity, actively involved in visiting flood victims and encouraging people to donate to charitable organizations (D'Zurilla, 2010). The obvious lack of celebrity endorsements in Pakistan was presumably a factor in attracting less media attention, presumably causing the public to be less aware of the crisis and the demand for humanitarian aid.

The celebrity endorsement effect in the case of Haiti and Pakistan can be explained in terms of "The Oprah Effect," described by Andrew Pease and Paul Brewers (2008). The Oprah Effect is the ability of a celebrity figure to influence public opinion in the context of a campaign. Pease and Brewers' study (2008) discussed Oprah Winfrey, a popular daytime talk show host's effect on Barack Obama's 2008 Democratic presidential campaign, as heightening news coverage on her endorsement:

"The news about Winfrey's endorsement shaped perceptions of Obama's viability

dovetails with the tendency of Pew respondents to see the endorsement as helping

his candidacy. Taken together, these two strands of evidence suggest that news coverage of the endorsement had the potential to shape public opinion about Obama's prospects for winning the nomination" (Pease & Brewers, 2008, p. 395). Similarly, endorsements by celebrities such as Oprah, an admired and trusted figure around the world, helped shape viewers' understanding of the Haiti crisis and the demand for public donations in this context. In other words, when Oprah encourages her loyal viewers to donate, they will generally follow suit.

Endorsements essentially help audiences determine what they value based on the positions taken by celebrities or other public figures they admire. Audiences tend to consider one perspective or issue, that of their preferred celebrity to be more important than others; as a result, they give less attention and perhaps ignore other issues (Pease & Brewers, 2008). Thus, as Oprah, along with other celebrities made use of their popularity to endorse foundations set up to assist in the Haiti recovery, the lack of celebrity acknowledgment for the Pakistan flood not only limited public awareness, it limited the incentive to donate to foundations set up to help the victims in Pakistan as the disaster lacked the same popularity and celebrity attachment.

Geographical Proximity & the Media

The media generally focuses on events that occur locally and in a broadcaster's own hemisphere. News outlets in Canada tend to focus on issues that are not only relevant to Canadians, but that take place in close geographical proximity. Canada is approximately 1,900 miles from Haiti and 6,200 miles from Pakistan (World Atlas, 2010). The difference in news coverage between Haiti and Pakistan may be explained by the proximity of Haiti to Canada in comparison to Pakistan. The earthquake in Haiti was much more accessible for the media to access and report about, which allowed for less travel expenses and limited any potential

technical problems for Canadian broadcasters. Also, more journalists and camera crews may have been available to cover the earthquake as the shorter travel distance to Haiti compared to Pakistan (Luke, 2007).

Media & Natural Disasters

An obvious difference between the Haiti and Pakistan crises was in the type of disaster. The earthquake in Haiti occurred suddenly with little warning. People could not be evacuated early enough in an effort to reduce the risk and inform the public on how to respond when the first tremor struck. Pakistan on the other hand, experienced large-scale flooding as a result of heavy rainfall over an extended period of time. Earthquakes are known to generate severe crises. Some of these crises include large-scale destruction to buildings, risk of aftershocks, significant numbers of casualties, debilitating injuries, and challenges in assembling support teams to minimize future risk and initiate restoration initiatives (Ferris, 2010). As a result, earthquakes tend to receive greater global interest, as they are normally immediate tragedies and frequently generate an instantaneous response from the media and the public.

A flood, on the other hand, is known to generate far less media interest than an earthquake. As note in Elizabeth Ferris' report (2010), the massive flooding of the Yangtze, Yellow and Songhua Rivers in China forced an evacuation of over 120 million people and destroyed over 160,000 homes in 1998. Yet, as tragically destructive as this flood was, it received very little international media attention. Olsen, Cartensen & Hoyen (2003) reflect on the media, government and public interest in natural disasters. These authors suggest that interest, particularly media interest, depends on the intensity of the natural disaster. The difference in the level of intensity between the Haiti and Pakistan disasters, and the earthquake appearing far more

severe, may have influenced the absence in media attention and concern for the flood, possibly influencing the disparity in media attention, government and public response.

Donor Fatigue

Finally, *donor fatigue* may have contributed to the public's participation in the Haiti and Pakistan recovery. The audiences responded generously to funding appeals following the earthquake early in 2010. Once the floods began in July, the public may have felt depleted of its ability to contribute to foundations set up to help victims in Pakistan, diminishing donor response (Haider, 2010). Also, events that take occur during the summer months, such as the flood generally receive less public attention as people tend to be away on vacation, thereby paying less attention to issues of the day. Thus, the timing of the flood may have impacted funding and donor response.

CHAPTER VI

Conclusion

The findings and discussion in this study were somewhat limited as a result of the number of documents interpreted in my analysis. A larger number of articles and editorials may have provided a greater understanding for how the media take an ideological position when reporting and presenting in the future. However, in light of the short timeframe allocated to complete the Major Research Project, the total of 20 documents may be considered a sufficient number for collection and interpretation.

My analysis broadened the discussion of agenda-setting and critical discourse analysis. I have demonstrated that the media has the potential to influence attitudes and behaviours, which can in turn impact the lives of others. Specifically, I revealed how the judgments and underlying ideologies conveyed in the media can impact humanitarian aid and the lives of victims in crises. In the future I would suggest conducting a visual discourse analysis to evaluate the photos selected by the media to demonstrate the destruction of these disasters. I would also recommend carrying out primary data collection through interviews. Interviews may be useful in a future research project to investigate how the public was affected by the images and discourse in relation to the Haiti and Pakistan disasters, and how this may have impacted their decision to help the victims in crises.

In summation, my analysis observed news media coverage of international crises. I investigated how the media take an ideological position when reporting and presenting events to their audience. My findings demonstrate that larger historical and sociopolitical ideologies, specifically Canada's paternalistic and discriminatory ideologies, may have affected the media's response and the public's understanding of the Haiti earthquake and Pakistan flood. This study indicates that the media not only focused more attention on Haiti, but that the media also

emphasized certain characteristics, and made critical judgments particular to the disaster and region of the crisis. For instance, the media's focus related to the corruption and political unrest in Pakistan and the Middle East, which may have influenced and or enhanced the public's critical and even discriminatory perception towards the region. My analysis also discovered a paternalistic orientation in media descriptions Canada's proposed strategies for assisting in the Haiti recovery mission. Such a rationale confirms and enforces the *west-knows-best* ideology. Finally, my investigation revealed that agenda-setting did in fact play a critical role in influencing the tremendous difference in humanitarian support between the Haiti and Pakistan disasters. The limited amount of media attention in Canada was surely a factor in the inadequate support from corporation, individuals, and foundations to the victims in Pakistan. Accordingly, the awareness of the flood was limited while the well-publicized crisis in Haiti enabled a greater understanding and overall awareness of the crisis in order to motivate donor behaviour. Nonetheless, the agenda-setting function that occurred between the Haiti and Pakistan crises involved several more complex factors that led to the discrepancy in media coverage and government and public support.

Acknowledging the various factors that may have contributed to the difference in media coverage and public support in the case of the 2010 Haiti and Pakistan disasters is the first step to addressing the critical issue of assisting victims of natural disasters (Ferris, 2010). The fundamental matter is that when victims are suffering, it becomes a human rights crisis. Pakistanis struggled with disease and were left without food, shelter and clean water for weeks, receiving inadequate humanitarian support. This raises questions, such as, what protocols do international institutions follow to provide humanitarian aid to countries in crisis and who influences the development of these protocols? Whether a crisis is an earthquake or flood, the same course of action must be taken in order to protect the lives and human rights of those

affected. Thus, regardless of media attention, which is ultimately out of the control of international institutions, these agencies should follow the same protocols and provide similar lifesaving support to protect the basic human rights of the victims in need of food, clean water, and shelter in the same timely and financial manner appropriate for the respective region and crisis.

References

Adams, W. (1986). Whose lives count? TV coverage of natural disasters. *Journal of Communication*, 36 (2), 113-122.

Althusser, L. (1971). *Ideology and ideological state apparatuses*. In Lenin and Philosophy. Retrieved March 18, 2011 from http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/althusser/1970/ideology.htm

Besova, A., & Cooley, S. C. (2009). Foreign news and public opinion: Attribute agenda-setting theory revisited. *African Journalism Studies,* 30 (2), 219-242.

Dearing, J. (1996). In Rogers E. M. (Ed.), *Agenda-setting*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication.

Elliot, J. & Pais, J. (2006). Race, class, and hurricane Katrina: Social difference in human responses to disaster. *Social Science Research*, 35 (2), 295-321.

Embassy of Canada in Haiti. (2011). *Canada in Haiti*. Retrieved March 15, 2011 from http://www.canadainternational.gc.ca/haiti/index.aspx?lang=eng.

Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical discourse analysis. The critical study of language*. London: Langman.

Fairclough, N. (2001). *Language and Power, 2nd Ed*. Harlow, UK: Pearson

Fanon, F. (1961). *Wretched of the earth*. NY: Grove Press

Ferris, E. (2010). Natural disaster and human rights: Comparing responses to Haiti and Pakistan. *Brookings Institution*. Retrieved January 28, 2011 from http://www.brookings.edu/papers/ 2010/0826_earthquakes_floods_ferris.aspx

Gramsci, A. (i) History of the subaltern classes; (ii) the concept of "ideology"; (iii) cultural themes: Ideological material. In Graham, M.G. & Kellner, D. (Eds.), *Media and Cultural Studies: Keynotes*. (2004). Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing

Government of Canada. (2011). *Canada - Pakistan Relations*. Retrieved from

http://www.canadainternational.gc.ca/pakistan/bilateral_relations_bilaterales/index.aspx?l

ang=eng

Haider K. (2010). *U.N. battles donor fatigue for funds for Pakistan*. Retrieved August 1, 2010

from: http://www.reuters.com/article/2010/08/17/ us-pakistan-floods-

idUSTRE66T3RS20100817

Higman, B. (2011). *A concise history of the Caribbean*. NY: Cambridge University Press

Hirchi, M. (2007). Media representations of the middle east. *Media Development*, 54 (2), 7-11.

Hodge, R. & Kress, G. (1993). *Language as ideology*. London: Routledge

Lindlof, T. & Taylor. B. (2002). *Qualitative communication research methods (2nd Ed.)*

Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication

Luke, C. (2007). As seen on TV or was that my phone?: New media literacy. *Policy Future in

Education*, 5 (1), 50-58.

McCombs, M. (2004). *Setting the agenda: The mass media and public opinion*. Cambridge,

UK: Blackwell Publication.

McCombs, M., & Shaw, D. (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public Opinion

Quarterly*, 36 (2), 176-187.

Mukerji, M. (August 31, 2010). Few Canadians have made donations to help Pakistan. *Angus

Reid Public Opinion*. Retrieved November 20, 2010 from: http://www.angus-

reid.com/polls/43197/few-canadians-have-made-a-donation-to-help-pakistan/

Nelson, T., Clawson, R. & Oxley, Z. (1997). Media framing of civil liberties conflict and its

effect on tolerance. *The American Political Science Review*, 91 (3), 567-583.

Olsen, G., Cartensen, N. & Hoyen, K. (2003) Humanitarian crises: What determines the level of

emergency assistance? Media coverage, donor interest and the aid business. *Disasters*, 27

(2), 109-126.

Scheufele A. & Tewsbury D. (2007). Framing, agenda setting, and priming: The evolution of

three media effects models. *Journal of Communication*, 57 (1), 9-20.

Schryer, C, (2000). Walking the fine line. *Journal of Business and Technical Communication*,

14 (2), 445-497.

Winthrop, R. (2010). An estimated 20 million Pakistanis in desperate need: Why so little media

attention? *Brookings Institution*. Retrieved January 28, 2011 from http://

www.brookings.edu/opinions/2010/0818_pakistan_flood_winthrop.aspx

World Atlas. (2010). Distances. Retrieved December 3, 2010

from:http://www.worldatlas.com/aatlas/infopage/howfar.htm